From:

Katherine Linder

Sent:

Thursday, March 02, 2017 6:31 PM

To:

'plsgls@gmail.com'

Subject:

Your Email of Feb 28, 2017

Dear Ms. Sobel-Sorenson,

Thank you for contacting our office. Your message will be shared with the board.

Kate Linder | Secretary to the Board

W 602-229-2514 | Katherine.Linder@azregents.edu

2020 N. Central Avenue, #230 | Phoenix, AZ 85004 | www.azregents.edu





EDUCATE - DISCOVER - IMPACT

From: form\_engine@fs6.formsite.com [mailto:form\_engine@fs6.formsite.com]

Sent: Tuesday, February 28, 2017 3:14 PM

To: Katherine Linder

Subject: azregents - contact us Result #11789360

Reference #

11789360

Status

Complete

Name: \*

patricia sobel-sorenson

Email Address \*

plsgls@gmail.com

**Questions / Comments** 

HOW LOW CAN YOU GO? a scum devil v.p. for PREZ. of UA?

Last Update

2017-02-28 15:13:15

**Start Time** 

2017-02-28 15:11:39

Finish Time

2017-02-28 15:13:15

IP

174.18.13.91

Browser

Firefox

OS

Linux

Referrer

https://www.azregents.edu/contact-us

From:

Katherine Linder

Sent:

Thursday, March 02, 2017 9:59 AM

To:

'Spruce90@aol.com'

Subject:

Your Email of Mar 1, 2017

Dear Mrs. Spivack,

Thank you for your message concerning the candidates for the next president of the University of Arizona. The board appreciates and values the feedback it receives from the public, and your message will be shared with the board.

Thank you.

Kate Linder | Secretary to the Board W 602-229-2514 | <u>Katherine Linder@azregents.edu</u> 2020 N. Central Avenue, #230 | Phoenix, AZ 85004 | <u>www.azregents.edu</u>

----Original Message----

From: Harvey Spivack [mailto:spruce90@aol.com]

Sent: Wednesday, March 01, 2017 7:48 AM

To: Julie Newberg < Julie. Newberg@azregents.edu>

Subject: UA Tucson

To the Regents,

Both of your choices are excellent. As a donor to UA I would be more comfortable with Dr Robbins. The 'University has moved in to the world of business as well as education and my feeling is that this candidate 's experience would better serve our school.

Thank you,

Rica Spivack (Mrs Harvey Spivack)

Spruce90@aol.com

Tucson, Az

Sent from my iPad in sunny Tucson, Arizona

From:

form\_engine@fs6.formsite.com on behalf of Formsite <form\_engine@fs6.formsite.com>

Sent:

Wednesday, March 01, 2017 11:34 AM

To:

Katherine Linder

Subject:

azregents - contact us Result #11796194

Reference #

11796194

Status

Name: \*

richard fink

Email. Address \* ribec1@cox.net

Ouestions / Comments

Arizona Board of Regents,

I am writing to express my opinion regarding the search for a new president of the UA. I have been a supporter of the university for more than 40 years and care deeply that it is successful in all the goals it hopes to attain.

I very much appreciate your efforts in assuring that you find the right individual, at a critical time in our history, to lead the UA now and into the future.

As a contributer to the university and someone who has served on a committee in the past ,the results of the last search did not prove to be all that was envisioned.

I firmly believe we need to think outside the box and bring in someone who has experience in running an organization and institution as large as the UA. We need leadership that will put us on sound financial footing that allows us to circumvent the current environment we live in. I strongly endorse Dr. Robbins for this position.

The little I know of him I believe of the two candidates, he brings all the skills and background

in running a successful worldwide respected institution that the UA would benefit from for years to come. This decision on your part is extremely important to the UA as well as the Tucson community.

I hope you will consider my request in your deliberations. Thank you for listening as well as your efforts in this matter.

Sincerely. Richard Fink

Last Update

Start Time

2017-03-01 11:14:20

Finish Time

2017-03-01 11:34:27

IP

68.230.58.34

Browser

IE

OS

Windows

Referrer

http://www.azregents.edu/contact-us

From:

form\_engine@fs6.formsite.com on behalf of Formsite <form\_engine@fs6.formsite.com>

Sent:

Wednesday, March 01, 2017 10:11 AM

To:

Katherine Linder

Subject:

azregents - contact us Result #11795311

Reference #

11795311

Status

Complete

Name: \*

**BRUCE SIMON** 

Email Address \* simonb@email.arizona.edu

Questions / Comments March 1, 2017

Arizona Board of Regents

The names of two very qualified candidates for President of the U of A have been published.

My question: Given the failure of the selection process for the last president (who was selected without visiting the U of A administration, faculty, and students); isn't it reasonable that we should learn from this experience and bring the finalists to meet appropriate people they will work with BEFORE the final selection is made. This is the way most if not all of the faculty and administration members are selected. Some candidates who 'looked good' on paper, were found to be totally unacceptable after the on iste visit!

Thank you for a reply (either via email or telephone) at y our earliest convenience.

Bruce R. Simon, Professor Emeritus Aerospace and Mechanical Engineering [and past chair of faculty and department head search committees] The University of Arizona

Cell: 520 920 2518

Last Update

2017-03-01 10:11:28

**Start Time** 

2017-03-01 09:53:30

Finish Time

2017-03-01 10:11:28

IP

69.244.0.179

Browser

Chrome

OS

Windows

Subject:

search input

From: Nadel, Lynn - (nadel)

Date: Sun, Mar 5, 2017 9:29 PM

To: Chad Sampson;rshoopman@salc.org;WRIDENOU@FCLAW.com;rtmyers1@comcast.net;

Cc: Nadel, Lynn - (nadel);
Subject:search input

Dear Chad, and Regents Ridenour, Shoopman and Myers:

I append below a summary of the input I received from a smattering of faculty in the past two days or so - hope that it helps as the Regents collectively grapple with this tough decision. I trust you will share this with the rest of your colleagues on the board. As strong as both candidates are, I have a preference, stated below.

Good luck!!

Lyr	ın
-----	----

Summary of Faculty Input on the two finalists

In response to a request for input from UA faculty I received a fair number of comments, the gist of which I summarize below. I would be remiss if I didn't also note that many of the comments expressed frustration at the general lack of faculty input to the process. I tried my best to help these individuals understand the constraints of top-level searches these days, but doubt that I fully succeeded. This puts extra pressure on making a choice that works out well for the UA.

#### The comments:

- Both finalists were viewed positively by almost all commenters, as individuals of significant accomplishment.
- Amongst those who expressed one, there was a sizable preference for Dr. Panchanathan, reflecting a number of things, including his proven commitment to Arizona, his long history in an academic setting, his broad skill set as it relates to innovation, and his personality. This was influenced by the fact that many of the commenters had direct experience with Panch every single one of whom was struck by his qualities as a person. Words like open-minded and team-spirited were used frequently. His commitment to diversity and his global footprint were also noted.
- Amongst those who preferred Dr. Robbins, the focus was on his organizational prowess, his international reach, and the fact that those who know him often remark on his superb relationship-building skills. One of the points raised was that the appointment of Dr. Robbins would immediately enhance the visibility of the UA, given his stature, and the position he currently holds.
- On the flip side, the concerns expressed about Panch solely related to his ASU connection, and what this might mean for the UA. Concerns about Dr. Robbins related to the fear that he might find it hard to

connect with the entire campus. While AHSC was considered to be critical even by these commenters, there was a fear that it would unduly dominate his approach. There was also some concern about the salary issue, and whether or not the UA would be a stepping-stone rather than a destination.

If I might add my own view — I am impressed by both finalists but I think Dr. Panchanathan is the right choice. I believe he would bring a new level of excitement to the UA — and would similarly invigorate our supporters outside the campus community. While quite decisive, he seems firmly committed to a meritocratic approach, which works well in an academic setting. This would go a long way to assuaging the concerns of those faculty who wished they had a bigger role in the selection process. I could see him leading the UA successfully for many years to come.

Hope these comments are helpful. Whoever you choose will receive a positive welcome from the faculty at the UA, given that both have a record of substantial scholarship. After that it would be up to the new President to succeed, by doing the right things often enough, and the wrong things as infrequently as possible. Good luck, and you can count on my support once the choice has been made.

Lynn Nadel Chair of the Faculty

Regents Professor of Psychology and Cognitive Science University of Arizona nadel@u.arizona.edu

From:

Katherine Linder

Sent:

Monday, March 06, 2017 5:29 PM

To:

regents@azregents.edu

Cc:

Eileen Klein; Nancy Tribbensee; Jennifer Pollock

Subject:

Letter of Support for Dr. Panchanathan

Dear Regents,

Some of you may have already received the following letter of support for Dr. Panchanathan, but wanted to make sure you all had a chance to see it.

Thank you - Kate

From: Justin Williams < justin@wi.lliams.com > Date: March 6, 2017 at 12:52:12 PM MST To: < Lyndel.Manson@azregents.edu >

Subject: Letter of Support for Dr. Panchanathan

Regent Manson,

Thank you for your service and leadership to our state. The work you do is key to the short and long term success of our state and all too often unrecognized. Thank you.

I understand that this week you are considering finalists and voting to fill the role of President of the University of Arizona. I am writing as a citizen, informed in my thinking by my experience as a UA alumni, as the Founder & CEO of Startup Tucson, and as an employee of the University of Arizona including my role as Executive Director of Innovate UA and a lecturer of entrepreneurship in both the Colleges of Business and Engineering.

I give my strong support to and encourage you to vote in favor of selecting Dr. Sethuraman Panchanathan to be the next President of the University of Arizona. From my experience having met several times with Dr. Panchanathan, I see several factors that will make him an outstanding leader of our University.

I believe Dr. Panchanathan will be able to:

chart a path toward success because he is a visionary leader who inspires people to embrace change.

- create the required buy-in across campus and the community because he is an true Arizonan, having lived here for so many years.
- attract top talent because has a deep personal understanding of the needs that top students, educators and researchers have within a diverse research university.
- lead change inside the University because has the powerful and authentic personality necessary to inspire the trust and confidence needed to lead a diverse faculty through a new and challenging changes ahead.
- moderate the most difficult cross-state issues because he brings with him an authentic personal commitment to the success and growth of our state.
- Improve student success having been a recognized educator in addition to his success as a researcher and administrator

Further, I am confident that Dr. Panchanathan has all of the tools needed to quickly gain the support of a broad community of civic leaders in Tucson and across the state and our alumni and donor networks.

For all of these reasons, I ask that you strongly consider selecting Dr. Panchanathan to be the next President at the University of Arizona.

Bear Down, Justin Williams Proud Wildcat

### **JUSTIN WILLIAMS**

UA MIS, Startup Tucson, EventSpyder

**C:** 520-270-0461

W: www.justinwilliams.co

E:justin@wi.lliams.com

S:Facebook, LinkedIn, Twitter, Google+

Schedule Meeting with MeetMe

Subject:

President

From: "Martinez, Fernando - (fdmartin)" < fdmartin@email.arizona.edu>

Date: February 28, 2017 at 3:13:53 PM MST

To: "rmyers@tempronics.com" <rmyers@tempronics.com>

Cc: "liz@arc.arizona.edu" liz@arc.arizona.edu>

Subject: President

Hi Rick, just saw the 2 choices for president. Absolutely outstanding. We could not do better. Congrats.

Fernando

Sent from my iPhone

Subject:

reply to yours

From: "Hildebrand, John G - (jhildebr)" < ihildebr@email.arizona.edu>

Date: March 6, 2017 at 8:46:09 AM MST
To: Richard Myers < <a href="mailto:rtmyers1@comcast.net">rtmyers1@comcast.net</a>>

Subject: reply to yours

Dear Rick,

Thanks for your note and for thinking of me.

I've done some "due diligence" with respect to the two finalists but haven't turned up anything very noteworthy. Here's what I can offer:

A senior colleague (and department head) at the Texas Medical Center reports that he has not had any interactions with Dr. Robbins but says that "he seems to be highly regarded. He has taken many positive steps to enhance collaboration among institutions in the Texas Medical Center."

Two senior colleagues at ASU sent me quite positive remarks about Dr. Panchanathan. One, a widely respected female scholar, wrote: "He works closely with Michael Crow, and they get along well and work well together with the Regents and legislature, so it would probably be very effective for the state and for both universities to have them working together. Panch is a computer scientist, I'm sure you know, and very supportive of computational efforts across the university. He has been quite helpful with the computational history and philosophy of science efforts in our group, and he has supported out digital MBL History Project. He's good to putting together cooperative efforts internally. I find that he sometimes lacks imagination when it comes to "counting the beans" that we seem to do all too much in academia; he couldn't figure out a way to acknowledge or take credit for the grants I have through [another research institution] or the \$1.2 million that my colleague has through the EU, for example. We pointed out that if he could develop a parallel tracking system for such efforts, they would add up, and he could present the university's connectedness more effectively. Michael "gets it," but Panch couldn't figure how to do it. Fair enough. He understood the questions. He always does. Smart guy, effective manager overall (though has relied on much lesser minds at times), and probably a good choice."

The second ASU colleague, a man who previously led one of the ASU Schools wrote: "I am not surprised the he is short-listed. He has worked closely with Michael Crow for several years and is now effectively second in command of the university. I, and others, have had the impression that he was looking and waiting for the right offer. In short, I think he has the experience and vision to be a good President for the U of AZ. I have interacted with him a lot and find him very open and approachable. He communicates well, and he is very clear about giving his take on anything. He won't say one thing then do another, as some administrators do. In terms of approach, I don't have the impression that his style will be quite as 'top-down' as MC's. Maybe it's also a good thing too that he will arrive already with a good working relationship with MC and with ABOR."

I also have discussed these candidates with senior colleagues here in the UofA and thought about the two quite a bit. From this local deliberation, I can offer the following:

Robbins: We are concerned that he appears to have had very little experience with the non-medical part of universities. As you know well, the greatest strengths of the UA are in the main campus, while the medical schools have never approached the renown enjoyed by several parts of the core University.

While we certainly want the medical schools to improve, there is a feeling around the UA that the medical schools have "sucked up the oxygen" through the last two presidencies, at the peril of the core University. We see no reason to be optimistic that perceived neglect of the core University would improve under the leadership of a person whose whole career has focused on medicine. If Robbins were selected, we feel that he would need a very strong and deeply experience provost, to whom he would delegate a lot of authority and resources to lead the core academic operations.

Panchanathan: There is considerable concern among us that he might be inclined to follow the leadership style of his "mentor" at ASU, Michael Crow, and bring to the UA strongly top-down management. There is fear that he might do away with RCM and revert to budget management in which resources accrue to the central administration for distribution as they wish, rather following the principles of RCM that are still being implemented here. If changes like those were brought to the UA, they would not go over well here. In the last decade it has been hard enough to retain our best faculty – as the UA has become a sort of "happy hunting ground" for many other universities that enjoy vastly greater resources than we have. That problem would almost certainly become much worse if the principles of shared governance and RCM that are established at the UA were replaced by top-down, autocratic management and budgeting. Of course this is a kind of "guilt by association" – we don't know whether Panchanathan would emulate Michael Crow's approach or not.

Again, I am grateful for your interest in my input, and I wish you and your fellow Regents well in the final step toward appointment of our new president.

With best regards, John

----Original Message-----

From: Richard Myers [mailto:rtmyers1@comcast.net]

Sent: Sunday, March 05, 2017 9:16 PM

To: jgh@neurobio.arizona.edu

Subject: Talk?

John. Do you have any thoughts on the candidates that you would like to share with me? Rick Myers

Sent from my iPhone

Subject:

Jeff Stevens Letter

Attachments:

AZ Board of Regents Letter.pdf

From: "Stevens, Jeff" < Jeff.Stevens@wnr.com >

Date: March 8, 2017 at 4:11:21 PM MST

To: "greg.patterson@azregents.edu" <greg.patterson@azregents.edu>, "Bill.Ridenour@azregents.edu"

<Bill.Ridenour@azregents.edu>, "Ram.Krishna@azregents.edu" <Ram.Krishna@azregents.edu>,

"Jay.Heiler@azregents.edu" <Jay.Heiler@azregents.edu>, "Rick.Myers@azregents.edu" <Rick.Myers@azregents.edu>,

"Ron.Shoopman@azregents.edu" <Ron.Shoopman@azregents.edu>, "Larry.Penley@azregents.edu"

<Larry.Penley@azregents.edu>, "Lyndel.Manson@azregents.edu" <Lyndel.Manson@azregents.edu>,

"Jared.Gorshe@azregents.edu" <Jared.Gorshe@azregents.edu>, "Vianney.Careaga@azregents.edu"

<Vianney.Careaga@azregents.edu>, "sheri.partridge@azed.gov" <sheri.partridge@azed.gov>, "bconley@az.gov"

<bcookley@az.gov>

**Subject: Jeff Stevens Letter** 

Dear Board of Regents,

Please find attached a letter to each of you and Governor Ducey expressing my thanks and appreciation for an outstanding job in selecting the President of the University of Arizona.

Sincerely,

Jeff Stevens CEO

Western Refining



March 8, 2017

The Arizona Board of Regents 2020 N. Central Avenue, Suite 230 Phoenix, AZ 85004-4593

Dear Regents,

This letter is to extend my compliments to the entire Board of Regents and members of its staff who were involved in the recent selection of the new President of the University of Arizona. As a member of the Search Committee, I was impressed by the very professional and effective manner in which the entire procedure was handled.

Regent Bill Ridenour and Regent Ron Shoopman created an inclusive and open atmosphere for the 27 member committee. The group reviewed over 100 qualified applicants and spent a great deal of time evaluating and discussing each candidate. It was a complex task and a very difficult decision, and overall, I felt the Board was respectful of the Search Committee's input. It is obvious that they carefully considered the Committee's points of view. The Regents and the Search Committee worked through this challenge together. That in itself, along with selecting an excellent final candidate, gives me a tremendous sense of pride.

It was truly an honor to serve on the Board's Search Committee and I believe the Regents and staff did an outstanding job throughout this process. I am also appreciative that the Governor and his staff were deeply engaged and active in this selection.

Dr. Robbins is an outstanding individual, and I am confident he will be an influential leader for the University of Arizona and our entire state in the years to come.

Sincerely.

Teff Stevens

Chief Executive Officer

Western Refining

CC: Governor Doug Ducey Arizona Republic Arizona Daily Star



University Libraries 1510 East University Blvd. P.O. Box 210055 Tucson, AZ 85721-0055

February 10, 2017

#### Dear UA Presidential Search Committee Members:

As the University prepares to recruit and hire a new president for the University of Arizona, the University Libraries' Diversity, Social Justice and Equity Council (DSJEC) encourages the committee to consider the importance of selecting a finalist committed to diversity. This hire could powerfully demonstrate that success and progress are dependent on inclusive excellence.

Recognizing and respecting all individuals in our diverse society is a strategic imperative. By leading in this area, the University is helping to establish a new paradigm of student learning that will be important for the future of higher education worldwide.

Sincerely,

University Libraries' Diversity, Social Justice and Equity Council

Shelly Black
Bob Diaz
Shannon Jones
Ellen Lawrence-Barnes
David Mayhew
Cheryl Neal (Chair)
Annabelle Nuñez
Jerry Perry
Sofia Petropoulos
Ping Situ
Shawna Thompson
Niamh Wallace